

California Agricultural Land Equity Task Force

May 9, 2024 | 8:00 am – 4:30 pm

The San Diego Foundation, San Diego

Participation Guidelines

**Share, Listen,
Learn**

**Respect Different
Perspectives**

Stay on Point

Public Comment Process

IN PERSON

- Submit the public comment card on the front table
- Separate form for each item
- Listen for your name and line up by the podium
- Staff will call your name to the podium
- Please adhere to time limit determined by the Chair (2 minutes)

VIRTUAL

- Complete form at sgc.ca.gov/meetings
- Separate form for each item
- Listen for your name and “raise your hand” on Zoom
- Staff will unmute your microphone
- Please adhere to time limit determined by the Chair (2 minutes)

Zoom Tips

- All participants are **muted** upon entry.
 - You will be unmuted when it is your time to speak.
 - Please remember to mute yourself after speaking.
- Cameras are optional.
- Use “Raise Hand” feature during public comment periods.

Agenda Review

- Approval of Meeting Summary from 02.16.2024
- Staff Report
- Site Visit Reports
- Roundtable Discussions with Invited Guests
 - Staff Overview
 - Resource Provider Perspective
 - Farmer Perspective
- Action: Grant Subcommittee Formation
- Work Planning
- General Public Comment

Draft Meeting Summary from 02.16.2024

Strategic Growth Council Staff Report

Membership and Staffing Updates

Task Force membership:

Darlene Franco was appointed to the Task Force by the Strategic Growth Council on Feb. 28, 2024. Welcome, Darlene!

Staffing update:

SGC is hiring a Legal and Task Force Analyst.

Reminder: Ethics Training

As per Bylaws Section II.A.6, Task Force members must complete the Office of the Attorney General's (OAG) and the Fair Practices Commission's Ethics Training Course. The training course is located on the OAG's website:

<https://oag.ca.gov/ethics/course>

Please inform staff once you have completed your training.

Announcements

- Shared in Briefing Packet
- Related Announcements from Task Force Members

Task Force Budget (as of Feb. 2024)

Category	FY 22–23 expenditures	FY 23–24 expenditures thru 02/2024	Total budgeted	Total obligated	Total remaining
Personnel (SGC staff)	\$0	\$67,381	\$1,121,689	\$1,121,689	\$0
Operating expenses (travel, facilitator, language access, etc.)	\$91,000	\$1,848	\$883,311	\$264,529	\$475,934
Research and technical assistance	\$0	\$0	\$270,000	\$0	\$270,000
Local assistance (e.g., grants, pilot projects, research)	\$0	\$0	\$1,000,000	\$0	\$1,000,000
TOTAL	\$91,000	\$69,229	\$3,255,000	\$1,286,218	\$1,745,934

Public Comment Process

IN PERSON

- Submit the public comment card on the front table
- Separate form for each item
- Listen for your name and line up by the podium
- Staff will call your name to the podium
- Please adhere to time limit determined by the Chair (2 minutes)

VIRTUAL

- Complete form at sgc.ca.gov/meetings
- Separate form for each item
- Listen for your name and “raise your hand” on Zoom
- Staff will unmute your microphone
- Please adhere to time limit determined by the Chair (2 minutes)

Site Visit Reports:

Agricultural Land Access and Tenure
in the San Diego Region

Site Visits

1. **Hukama Produce:** Irene and Ruth
2. **Pauma Tribal Farms:** Darlene and Dorian
3. **Project New Village:** Lawrence
4. **San Pasqual Valley Agricultural Preserve:** Doria and Liya
5. **Tijuana River Valley Incubation Plots:** Thea



Hukama Produce

Hukama Produce





Hukama Produce





Pauma Tribal Farms



Pauma Tribal Farms



Pauma Tribal Farms



Project New Village



Project New Village



Project New Village



San Pasqual Valley Agricultural Preserve



Tijuana River Valley Incubation Plots



Tijuana River Valley Incubation Plots

Public Comment Process

IN PERSON

- Submit the public comment card on the front table
- Separate form for each item
- Listen for your name and line up by the podium
- Staff will call your name to the podium
- Please adhere to time limit determined by the Chair (2 minutes)

VIRTUAL

- Complete form at sgc.ca.gov/meetings
- Separate form for each item
- Listen for your name and “raise your hand” on Zoom
- Staff will unmute your microphone
- Please adhere to time limit determined by the Chair (2 minutes)

15–Minute Break

Roundtable Discussions:

Resource Landscape

Staff Overview

Part I: Resource Provider Perspectives

Part II: Farmer Perspectives

Research Scope

- Overview of existing resources related to agricultural land equity
- **53 resources** identified
- Address:
 - **Access, acquisition, conservation**
 - **Grants, financing, technical assistance**
 - **State, federal, non-governmental organizations (NGOs)**
- Content analysis

Initial Observations

- Majority **grants and loans** administered by government agencies
- Majority **technical assistance** by NGOs
- Program design can reproduce existing inequities
- Resources fall along two continuums:
 - **Equity**
 - **Access**

Initial Observations – Grants (19)

- About **half state and federal grants** in this analysis focus on preserving private and public agricultural lands through **conservation easements**.
- Three quarters of **California state agency** grants give priority to applicants that reach **California Native American tribes and/or disadvantaged communities**.
- Only 3 of the 19 grants are designed to fund farmers and farm businesses directly.

Initial Observations – Financing (18)

- About half of these resources are **USDA Farm Services Agency loans**, many of which target underserved communities in their descriptions.
- **Eligibility criteria** can **prevent access** to underserved farmers.
- Half are provided by NGOs, which largely aim to offer **culturally informed, accessible service options**.

Initial Observations – Technical Assistance (16)

- **Diverse activities** including the development of community-based land ownership structures, connecting farmers' to public and private resources, meeting the unique needs of Native American tribes and agreement-building services, among other activities.
- Large majority are designed to **reach underserved producers and/or CA Native American tribes**.
- Almost all TA resources in this list offer **support directly to target population**, in contrast to the grant programs which often distribute funding first to organizations.

Equity & Access Continuums

ACCESS CONTINUUM

Funds direct changes to agricultural land access, tenure, acquisition or availability

EQUITY CONTINUUM

Equity is not explicitly considered in resource description and design

Explicitly designed to advance equity as primary goal.

Funds planning and/or capacity building that may lead to changes in land access

Equity & Access Continuums

ACCESS CONTINUUM

Livestock Grazing on
Public Lands, U.S.
Bureau of Land
Management

Increasing Land, Capital, and Market
Access Program, USDA Farm Services
Agency (FSA)

California Tribal Fund, First
Nations Development Institute

Multibenefit Land
Repurposing
Program, California
Department of
Conservation

Conservation
Reserve Program –
Transition Incentives
Program, USDA

EQUITY CONTINUUM

Farm
Succession
Coordinators,
International
Farm
Transition
Network

Intertribal Agriculture Council’s
Technical Assistance Program

Roundtable Discussions: Resource Landscape

Part I: Resource Provider Perspective

Invited Guests

- **Shanna Atherton-Bauer**, CA Department of Conservation
- **Anthony Chang**, Manzanita Capital Collective
- **Josiah Griffin**, USDA Office of Tribal Relations
- **Lena Ortega**, Intertribal Agriculture Council

Roundtable Format

1. Brief (5-7 minute) introductions from guests
2. Open discussion with Task Force members

Lunch Break

[Approx. 11:30 am – 12:30 pm]

Roundtable Discussions: Resource Landscape

Part II: Farmer Perspective

Invited Guests

- **Idzai Mubaiwa**, African Sisters Produce
- **Mai Nguyen**, Farmer Mai
- **Essence Oyos**, Golden Eagle Farm
- **Jessica Sanchez**, Terra Madre Gardens

Roundtable Format

1. Brief (5–7 minute) introductions from guests
2. Open discussion with Task Force members

Public Comment Process

IN PERSON

- Submit the public comment card on the front table
- Separate form for each item
- Listen for your name and line up by the podium
- Staff will call your name to the podium
- Please adhere to time limit determined by the Chair (2 minutes)

VIRTUAL

- Complete form at sgc.ca.gov/meetings
- Separate form for each item
- Listen for your name and “raise your hand” on Zoom
- Staff will unmute your microphone
- Please adhere to time limit determined by the Chair (2 minutes)

15–Minute Break

Possible Action:
Subcommittee Formation

Recommended Action and Next Steps

Recommend establishing a subcommittee to:

- Examine existing grant programs
- Review/report on funding gaps, challenges, and best practices to inform final recommendations

Suggest subcommittee report on its observations at the August or November 2024 Task Force meeting.

Work Planning

Possible Topics (“Bins”) – from Feb. Mtg.

1. Land Access and Tenure
2. Land Access for CA Native American Tribes
3. Land Markets
4. Financial Resources
5. Sustaining Natural Resources
6. Regulations
7. Meeting Diverse Farmer Needs

Work Planning

“Bins” From Feb.

1. Land Access and Tenure
2. Land Access for CA Native American Tribes
3. Land Markets
4. Financial Resources
5. Sustaining Natural Resources
6. Regulations
7. Meeting Diverse Farmer Needs

New Ideas from Today

- Easements and covenants
- Trust and fee land
- Farmer health to do work on the land
- Capacity
- Grass-roots organizing/networking for safe space
- Land access
- Land tenure
- Stakeholders: operating and non-operating landholders, public landholders, conservation inst. and community landholders, tribal governments
- Immigrant experiences, exclusions, opportunities

Topics to Move Forward

Is this a:

- Research area?
- Subcommittee?
- Meeting Topic?

What are immediate next steps?

Work Planning

“Bins” From Feb.

1. Land Access and Tenure
2. Land Access for CA Native American Tribes
3. Land Markets
4. Financial Resources
5. Sustaining Natural/Cultural Resources
6. Regulations
7. Meeting Diverse Farmer Needs

New Ideas from Today

- Regulations
- Land improvement (infrastructure, etc)
- Farmer tenant rights
- Lot size adjustment, carveouts, zoning and permitting
- Information gaps, knowledge about opportunities, ways info is communicated
- Ownership, having a stake in the land, autonomy
- Public dollars to land stewards
- Acquisition opportunity and mechanisms to respond timely, ways to replenish and sustain funds – timing question
- Solving for farmers and tribal nations

Topics to Move Forward

Is this a:

- Research area?
- Subcommittee?
- Meeting Topic?

What are immediate next steps?

Work Planning

“Bins” From Feb.

1. Land Access and Tenure
2. Land Access for CA Native American Tribes
3. Land Markets
4. Financial Resources
5. Sustaining Natural Resources
6. Regulations
7. Meeting Diverse Farmer Needs

New Ideas from Today

- Challenge in broader conversation about tribal nations’ land access or other communities
- Technology for farming, workforce
- New farmers, incentive for farming, livable wage, wellbeing
- Education of non-native population about tribal traditions and government
- Outreach to individuals and citizens
- How those with financial resources can support greater public

Topics to Move Forward

Is this a:

- Research area?
- Subcommittee?
- Meeting Topic?

What are immediate next steps?

Work Planning

“Bins” From Feb.

1. Land Access and Tenure
2. Land Access for CA Native American Tribes
3. Land Markets
4. Financial Resources
5. Sustaining Natural Resources
6. Regulations
7. Meeting Diverse Farmer Needs

New Ideas from Today

- Tenant farmers – protections, whether policies incentivize or disincentivize tenant farmers (e.g. SGMA)
- Notifications of land availability
- Improve connections between land seekers and land owners
- Educating on value of farming, respecting farmers
- Condense from Feb. into “resources”, include others e.g. healthcare
- Goal to have equitable outcomes
- Existing programs, capacity-building as pathway forward
- Legal framework that supports needs of land stewards

Topics to Move Forward

Is this a:

- Research area?
- Subcommittee?
- Meeting Topic?

What are immediate next steps?

Work Planning

“Bins” From Feb.

1. Land Access and Tenure
2. Land Access for CA Native American Tribes
3. Land Markets
4. Financial Resources
5. Sustaining Natural Resources
6. Regulations
7. Meeting Diverse Farmer Needs

New Ideas from Today

- Insurance
- Trainings and outreach
- Respect for land, honoring sacred sites
- Housing, challenges with immigration status
- Living on the land, esp. in relation to easements
- Capacity for non-profits and CBOs to assist farmers esp. immigrant farmers, e.g. with language access
- Racism in land sales, succession
- Zoning and housing on land
- Language barriers, ways to share opportunities widely

Topics to Move Forward

Is this a:

- Research area?
- Subcommittee?
- Meeting Topic?

What are immediate next steps?

Notes from today, continued:

- Establish subcommittee:
 - Community outreach: Darlene, Nelson, Qi, Emily
 - Sustaining natural/cultural resources: Emily, Darlene, Lawrence
 - Resource landscape subcommittee: Thea, James, Irene, Liya, Doria
- Action: Look into reconvening in June or July
- Staff will put forward ideas for consideration at next meeting

Looking Ahead: August 15, 2024

- All-day meeting on Thurs. August 15th in Sacramento

General Public Comment

Public Comment Process

IN PERSON

- Submit the public comment card on the front table
- Separate form for each item
- Listen for your name and line up by the podium
- Staff will call your name to the podium
- Please adhere to time limit determined by the Chair (2 minutes)

VIRTUAL

- Complete form at sgc.ca.gov/meetings
- Separate form for each item
- Listen for your name and “raise your hand” on Zoom
- Staff will unmute your microphone
- Please adhere to time limit determined by the Chair (2 minutes)

Decisions, Action Items, Next Steps

- Summary of Actions Taken
- Review of Action Items and Follow Up Items
- Meeting Notes, Recording, and Materials posted to:
<https://sgc.ca.gov/meetings/caletf/>

Thank You!